

提案 3

Reform of School Subjects Teaching for Comprehensive education

Yasuhiro Hokoyama
(Otemon Gakuin University)

Questions

First, when a recent Education Secretary, Ruth Kelly endorsed the concept 'genuine comprehensive education', what did she mean by the concept? And how do you define 'comprehensive education' without the presence of 'comprehensive schools'.

Secondly, to what extent and in what ways do you think has the national curriculum contributed to the successes of comprehensive education? For example, the National Curriculum 1988 missed citizenship education as a subject. But under the Labour government, citizenship has become one of the compulsory subjects in secondary education. Do you think this is a kind of success of comprehensive education.

Thirdly, in thinking about a curriculum plan for comprehensive schools, Lawton said that it would be wrong to start with a list of subjects. But most of secondary school teachers have their professional identities as subject specialists. So I think it is realistic to start to change secondary teachers' ideas about 'Why do I teach my subject' so that 'comprehensive education' is realized. On this point, to what extent and in what ways has secondary teacher education contributed to the successes or failure of comprehensive education?

1. Comprehensive ideal and reform of subjects teaching in Secondary Schools

The Newsom Report, *Half our Future*(1963) examined the curriculum of 13-16-year-olds of average or less than average ability.

Schools Council(1967) *The Raising of the School-Leaving Age*, London, HMSO.

↓

There was a move towards making the curriculum more 'relevant' to pupils who it was felt were increasingly disaffected and disengaged from the traditional 'grammar-school' curriculum.

'The problem to be addressed was this. How can we address the aspiration of secondary education for all, irrespective of age, ability and aptitude, where we deeply rooted in tradition of liberal education which seems accessible only to an academic few?'(Pring, 1997:89-90)

Ex) *The Humanities Curriculum Project*(Schools Council/Nuffield,1972).

Discussion as a method of teaching; Teacher as a neutral chairman; Themes which are relevant to adolescents: crime, family, education, etc.

However, too much emphasis upon relevance for the intellectually less able, or the culturally deprived, resulted in the two-track system.

Pring summarizes the attempts to render into programmes of learning the moral principles which lay at the basis of the comprehensive ideal as follows: (Pring, 1997:90-91)

- (i) they involve the exploration of values in the concrete situation of practical living;
- (ii) they require a shift from a dependence upon the authority of the teacher to a dependence upon the authority of evidence and reason;
- (iii) they therefore require the promotion of certain procedural values which enhance the capacity to reason, reflect and deliberate;
- (iv) they respect the experiences each learner brings to the exploration of these human situations—the value of which experiences relates more to the diversity of backgrounds and seriousness of reflection than it does to measured intelligence;
- (v) they attach importance to the dynamics of the group through which the exploration takes place, wider experience revealed, evidence pointed to, ideas tested out, further enquiries sponsored;
- (vi) they define the role of the teacher to be that of promoting the procedural upon which that exploration should draw, as the learners come to understand themselves and the social situation in which they live;
- (vii) such moral principles, therefore, insist upon academic integrity by referring personal enquiry to the key ideas drawn from recognized intellectual disciplines within the humanities and social sciences.

2. School Subjects knowledge: its exclusive characteristics (Goodson)

‘In the comprehensive schools whilst new curriculum initiatives developed new subject categories such as environmental studies, community studies, urban studies, womens studies and social studies, the stranglehold of the academic tradition remained.’

↓

Those integrated studies had low status compared to traditional subjects.

‘The very process of becoming a school subject therefore purges subject knowledge of its inclusionary characteristics.’

‘A pattern of subject knowledge based on selective exclusion became the lynchpin (most important part) of the curricula to be offered in comprehensive schools’ (Goodson 2005:149)

3. Survival strategy of a traditional academic subject: History

History was boring and useless for ordinary pupils in comprehensive schools in 1960’.

↓

Teachers have to find a way of reversing the decline of history as a school subject, and of responding to the negative reaction of many pupils to it.

↓

The Schools Council History Project was established in the early 1970’ and promoted new teaching methods in order to generate more active learning among pupils and placed greater emphasis on the use of resources in the classrooms.

↓

History teachers have been exploring a 'new' approach to school history.

↓

But it provoked a hostile and defensive counter-reaction from many politicians, tabloid newspapers, and right-wing think-tanks.

↓

The National Curriculum for history which emerged in the 1990s was an uneasy mix of old and new traditions of history teaching.

↓

There was a heavy emphasis on curriculum content, sustaining the idea that the main thing that young people got out of school history was a body of knowledge about the past.

There were however, several elements of 'new' history which were incorporated into the National Curriculum, such as the requirement to assess the significance of events, people and changes, to understand and evaluate differing interpretations and representations of the past, and to develop skills of enquiry.

☆Has the survival strategy of history contributed to development of comprehensive education? I think it has.

4. How can we improve fragmentation of school subjects teaching at secondary school?

'Key stage 3: an alternative strategy' (Quikle 2005)

'One of the many supposed strengths of the National Curriculum is that it is a broad and balanced curriculum which transmits knowledge in a way that produces well 'rounded', knowledgeable pupils who have acquired a range of skills'

'Pupils are required to acquire knowledge, skills and understanding in a large number of discrete subjects'

At Key Stage 3, all state schools have to teach thirteen subjects.

The National Curriculum Key stage 3: Each Subject teaching periods(average) per week	Course of study in Japan(2008): Each Subject teaching periods per week at lower secondary school
English-4	国語(Japanese)— 4
Math-4	数学(Math)— 4
Science-4	理科(Science)— 3
Design & technology-3	技術・家庭(Technology& — 2
Information and communication technology-3	
History-2	社会(Social Studies)— 3
Geography-2	
Modern foreign languages-3	外国語(Foreign language)— 4
Art & design-3	美術(Art)— 1 . 3
Music-1	音楽(Music)— 1 . 3
Physical education-3	体育(Physical education)— 3
Religious education-1	道徳(Moral education)— 1
Citizenship-1	特別活動(Special activities)— 1
Personal, social and health education	総合的学習の時間(Periods of integrated studies) — 2

‘Acquiring knowledge is not just about the acquisition of ‘fact’ and ‘information’ but the development of genuine ‘understanding’ and capacity for ‘critical thinking’.

‘In most subjects pupils are to be introduced to a tradition of enquiry which is relevant and ‘worthwhile’.

‘To understand the ‘shortfall’ in policy, we need to identify the essential requisites of teaching which would produce genuinely knowledgeable pupils.’

‘Acquiring knowledge requires a dialogical approach to teaching.’

‘A dialogical approach to teaching would require the teacher building up a certain kind of ‘bond’ with the pupils involving moral and emotional as well as cognitive aspects.’

‘Close’ relationships would need to be norm rather than the exception in the academic curriculum.

‘Pupils need to interact with teachers as ‘significant’ others.’

‘Dialogical relationship between teachers and pupils are fundamental to the acquisition of knowledge.’

‘Schools should be environments which empower these sorts of teacher-pupil relationships but we know that there are many barriers to the development of such relationships in schools.’

‘The subject teacher is one of thirteen teachers who teach a class of pupils between one to four periods a week.’

‘In that time they would have to ‘bond’ with the pupils dialogically.’

‘I am proposing a curriculum re-organisation which involves several subjects giving up some of their ‘space’ to revitalized and radical form of PSHE.’

‘DfES itself has advised that all subjects do not have to be taught in separate lessons.’

‘The main function of the enhanced PSHE curriculum would be to provide an arena where what I have described as dialogical approaches to teaching-learning the National Curriculum could be put into practice.’

‘PSHE would be an efficient way of addressing cross-curricular aim.’

‘For example, facilitating the development of group discussion skills would benefit all subjects and some aspects of methods of enquiry are common to all subjects.’

‘Curriculum coherence would be realized through an emphasis on process(e.g. learning how to learn, study skills)’

‘The PSHE curriculum should therefore contribute directly to raising standards in NC subjects and would itself be evaluated in terms of this contribution.’

‘Although it would be remain a non-examination subject, it would be clear that PSHE would in

fact be examined as part of one or more NC subjects.'

'It is important to stress that the PSHE would not be some form of alternative education.'

'For many pupils informal cultural aspects are more potent for identity formation than the formal culture of school subjects.'

'Teachers need the flexibility to construct programmes of study tailored to the needs and interests of their particular group of adolescent learners.'

'Once dialogical relations had been established it would be easier to introduce content more directly associated with specific NC subjects.'

'In pursuit of all this it will be assumed that the 'academic' and the 'pastoral' dualism will collapse.'

'The academic will be pastoral and the pastoral academic.'

5. Secondary Teacher Education and Comprehensive Education

Jane Jones 'Beyond the subject curriculum: the form tutor's role'(Dillon and Maguire,2001)

'It is important for form tutors not to be passive recipients of other people's materials and ideas but to show the initiative and creativity that they invariably demonstrate in their subject teaching. Tutors should seek to develop tutorial skills that can enhance the learning environment for the pupils and enable them to take advantage on a daily basis of all that the school offers. In the longer term, tutors help pupils to develop the skills and understanding needed to live confident, healthy and independent lives'(Jones, 2001:290)

References

- Dillon,J. and Maguire,M.(2001) *Becoming a Teacher: Issues in Secondary Teaching*. Buckingham: Open University Press
- Goodson,I(2005) 'The Exclusive Pursuit of Social Inclusion', *FOLUM*, Volume47, No.2,&3,2005,pp.145-150.
- Pring,R. and Walford,G.(1997) *Affirming the Comprehensive Ideal*. London: The Falmer Press.
- Quicke,J(2005) 'Key Stage3: an alternative strategy', *FORUM*, Volume 47, No.1, 2005,pp.30-33.